

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA 9 November 2005

Item No:	10
Address:	Swan Hotel 11 West Street Alresford Hampshire SO24 9AD
Parish/Ward	New Alresford
Proposal Description:	External alterations to change the brickwork and fenestration paint colours (RETROSPECTIVE)
Applicants Name	Mr And Mrs T Graham
Case No:	05/02087/LIS
W No:	W04421/19LB
Case Officer:	Mr Robert Ainslie
Date Valid:	23 August 2005
Delegated or Committee:	Committee Decision
Reason for Committee:	Parish Council submitted representations contrary to officer recommendation
Site Factors:	New Alresford Conservation Area Tree Preservation Order Within 50m of Listed Building Conservation Area Public Right of Way

Site Description

- The Swan Hotel is a Grade II listed building of some character in a prominent location on the corner of West Street and Station Road in the centre of New Alresford. The building is clearly visible on the approach to the centre of Alresford from the west. The land rises along West Street from West to East.
- The hotel falls within the New Alresford Conservation Area, where most of the buildings on East Street, West Street and Broad Street are listed.
- A large number of buildings in the conservation area have painted facades. Most of them accord with the Council's guidance on traditional paint colour in the New Alresford Conservation Area Technical Assessment 2001. There are a few which do not and if there has been a change in paint colour in recent years, it is likely this has been carried out without Listed Building Consent.

Relevant Planning History

- **W04421** Erection of single storey extension to bar - Application Permitted - 13/02/1979
- **W04421/01** Erection of 4 dwellings and garages - Car Park Rear Of Swan Hotel Station Road Alresford Hampshire - Application Withdrawn - 10/08/1979
- **W04421/02LBCA** Demolition of out building at rear of Swan Hotel _ demolition of old church hall in Station Road, extinguishment of public footpath no. 5 _ erection of 4 terraced houses and 4 garages _ improvement of public footpath no. 4: rear of Swan Hotel, Alresford - Car Park Rear Of Swan Hotel Station Road Alresford Hampshire - Application Permitted - 21/10/1980
- **W04421/03** Conversion of stable/barn to provide function room, bar and bedroom accommodation; erection of 3 dwellings, erection of 4 garages with staff flat over and creation of new vehicular access - Application Refused - 23/10/1984
- **W04421/04/LB** Conversion of stable/barn to provide function room bar and bedroom accommodation and erection of 4 garages with staff flat over -Application Permitted - 03/12/1986
- **W04421/05** Conversion of barn/stable to bedroom accommodation, erection of 3 dwellings, erection of 4 garages with staff flat over and creation of new vehicular access - Application Permitted - 03/05/1985
- **W04421/06** Use of land as car park - Car Park Rear Of Swan Hotel Station Road Alresford Hampshire - Application Permitted - 05/03/1986
- **W04421/07** Restaurant extension - Application Refused - 15/05/1987
- **W04421/08** Use of land as temporary car park - Application Permitted - 14/02/1989
- **W04421/09** Extension to functions room/restaurant and replacement toilet block - Application Withdrawn - 22/05/1990
- **W04421/10** Extensions and alterations to form restaurant, function room, kitchen and toilets - Application Refused - 06/09/1990
- **W04421/11** Change of use of basement from storage to dining room and kitchen - Application Permitted - 07/02/1991
- **W04421/12** Continued use of land for temporary car park- Car Park Rear Of Swan Hotel Station Road Alresford Hampshire - Application Permitted - 07/04/1992
- **W04421/13** 3 no. three bedroom dwellings; 1 no two bedroom flat with associated garages, parking, landscaping and new access - Application Permitted - 07/09/1995
- **W04421/14/LB** Partial demolition of brick and flint boundary wall to create new access - Application Permitted - 07/09/1995
- **W04421/15LB** Partial demolition of brick and flint boundary wall to create new access - Renewal of W4421-14LB - Car Park Rear Of Swan Hotel Station Road Alresford Hants - Application Permitted - 03/08/2000
- **W04421/16** Two storey extension to create 2 no. family apartments; conversion of existing room for disabled access - Application Permitted - 29/06/2005
- **W04421/17LB** Alterations to provide two storey extension - Application Permitted - 07/07/2005

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA 9 November 2005

- **W04421/18** Construction of 3 no 4 bedroom terraced houses and 4 no 2 bedroom flats with on site parking - Car Park Rear Of Swan Hotel Station Road Alresford Hampshire - Application Refused - 02/08/2005

Proposal

- This application is for retrospective listed building consent for the repainting of the external render, window and door surrounds and fenestration of the Swan Hotel.
- The main walls have been painted in Light Cobalt smooth masonry paint with the plinth window and door surrounds being painted in Pebble Drift 4 smooth masonry paint. The windows, feature lintels, trims and barge boards have been painted in gloss white with the lanterns, hanging baskets and main signage being painted in gloss black.

Consultations

Conservation:

- Recommend refusal
- The alteration is considered harmful to the special interest of this early 19th century Grade II listed building in terms of choice of colour and design of colour scheme.
- The alteration has adversely affected the setting of other listed buildings in West Street.
- The alteration has a detrimental effect on the historic streetscene and therefore does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

Representations:

New Alresford Parish Council

- Support application
- The repainting is an improvement on the former purple colour and is viewed favourably by local people who do not generally object to the blue colour on the Swan or on other Alresford properties.

No letters of representation have been received from neighbours

Relevant Planning Policy:

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review:

- UB3, E16

Winchester District Local Plan

- EN5, HG20

Winchester District Local Plan Review Deposit and Revised Deposit:

- DP3, HE14

Supplementary Planning Guidance:

- New Alresford Conservation Area Assessment

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

- PPS 1 General Policy and Principles
- PPG 15 Planning and the Historic Environment

Listed Building and Planning Considerations

The main considerations in respect of this application are:

- Principle of development
- Historic heritage/conservation area/listed building

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA 9 November 2005

Principle of development

- In determining an application for Listed Building Consent the local planning authority has a statutory requirement under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to 'have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest it possesses'.
- PPG15 does confirm (para 3.4) that applicants must be able to justify their proposals, showing why works which affect the character of the Listed Building are desirable or necessary. No information was submitted in support of the proposals explaining why the works are either desirable or necessary.
- Walls are the main structural fabric of a building. Alterations to wall surfaces are usually the most damaging that can be made to the overall appearance of a historic building. Alterations or repairs to external elevations should respect the existing fabric and match it in materials, texture, quality and colour (C8)
- Painting-or repainting with a change of colour – requires listed building consent when it could affect the character (C17).
- The proposed alteration to the listed buildings is also assessed against Policy HG20 of the Local Plan which states that listed building consent would not be granted for works which would adversely affect the architectural or historic character of the listed building (HE14 in the Revised Deposit of the Plan).
- It is also considered to affect the setting of other listed buildings in the streetscene and is therefore assessed against PPG15, paras.2.16-2.17 and Policy HG23 of the Local Plan (HE16 in the Revised Deposit of the Plan).
- Appendix 3 of the New Alresford Conservation Area Technical Assessment gives guidance on the significance of colour on buildings in the Conservation Area. The Technical Assessment was adopted by Winchester City Council after a period of public consultation and follows guidance in PPG15 and English Heritage guidance on conservation area appraisals. It stresses the importance of selecting appropriate colours suited to blending with traditional materials and local lighting conditions and the relationship of the proposed colour to colour on adjoining buildings.

Impact on special architectural and historic interest of listed building character and appearance of conservation area

- The design of the colours scheme is not considered sympathetic to the classical detailing of the listed building. White has been used to highlight 1st floor keystones, cornice above entrance, corniced window hoods and window surrounds. While a contrasting colour is used on eave cornice, door, window surrounds and plinth the quoins and string course have been painted the base colour applied to the walls. This accenting of certain features and covering other features which historically were painted in a contrasting colour is considered inappropriate. The highlighting of certain features is ill-conceived as it weakens the overall composition where light would normally pick out the architectural mouldings. The use of white gloss on stucco is technically inappropriate.
- A historic photograph from the early 20th century clearly shows that a contrasting dark shade was applied to quoins, plinth, string course and door and window surrounds without any highlighting of window keystones or cornices above entrance and ground floor windows. The design of the colour scheme in 1990 appears to follow that of the historic photo with only 2 colours used.
- The choice of colour is considered regrettable as the blue appears very bright in the streetscene and no evidence has been provided by the applicant to suggest it was a pigment likely to be used on a historic building of this period in a small Hampshire market town. The pale mauve creates an undesirable effect in that when used with the blue it gives the building an unfortunate polychrome appearance. Again this is not considered a historically appropriate colour and offers insufficient contrast in tone to the bright blue.
- The bright blue sits uncomfortably with the dark red and orange tones of the listed building's clay tile roof and the dappled grey of the flint wall on Station Road.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA 9 November 2005

- The same can be said of its affect on the adjacent and neighbouring listed buildings which have similar roofs, red brickwork or painted facades which are paler or have natural earth tones. The colourscheme is therefore considered to have an adverse effect on the setting of listed buildings and the streetscene in this part of the conservation area.
- Strong bright colours are more suited to harsher lighting conditions as found in Mediterranean latitudes and seaside locations. The mellower lighting conditions in Alresford suit earth pigments which relate well to each other and traditional building materials such as brick, flint, stone and clay roof tiles. The Conservation Area Technical Appraisal gives further guidance on this matter.
- It is considered that the repainting of the building in the current colours, is out of keeping with the historic character and appearance of this Grade II listed building.
- It is considered that this will set a precedent for other listed buildings.
- It is therefore considered that the proposals would not accord with Policy HG20 of the Adopted Local Plan and Policy HE14 of the Revised Deposit to the Local Plan in that it would adversely affect the historic character and appearance of the listed building to its detriment.

Recommendation

REFUSE – subject to the following refusal reason(s):

Conditions/Reasons

- 01 The proposed alteration would detract from the listed building's special architectural and historic interest in that the design of the colourscheme and choice of colour are considered unsympathetic. The proposal is considered contrary to Central Government Planning Policy Guidance Note 15, Policy HG20 of the Adopted Winchester District Local Plan and Policy HE14 of the Revised Deposit of the Local Plan.
- 02 The proposal adversely affects the setting of adjacent and other listed buildings viewed in the streetscene in West Street and is therefore contrary to Central Government Planning Policy Guidance Note 15, Policy HG23 of the Adopted Winchester District Local Plan and Policy HE16 of the Revised Deposit of the Local Plan.
- 03 The proposal does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of New Alresford Conservation Area and is therefore contrary to Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act) by reason of Policy HG6, HG7 and HG11 of the Adopted Winchester District Local Plan and Policy HE4, HE5 and HE8 of the Revised Deposit of the Local Plan and Government Planning Policy Guidance Note 15. The choice of colour does not conform with the guidance contained within Appendix 3 of the New Alresford Conservation Area Technical Assessment as adopted under Section 71 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act).
- 04 The proposals would be likely to set a precedent which would make it difficult to resist further applications for unacceptable colours, thereby having an adverse impact on the setting of the listed buildings and the character of the conservation area.

Informatives

01. The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review: UB3, E16

Winchester District Local Plan Proposals: EN5, HG20

Emerging Development Plan- WDLP Review Deposit and Revised Deposit: DP3, HE14